

**SYLLABUS**  
**Fall semester 2025-2026 academic year**  
**Educational program "7M04226 Law"**  
**1 course, English group**

| ID and name of the discipline  | Student’s independent work (SIW)  | Number of credits                  |   |                         | Total number of credits  | Student's independent work under the guidance of a teacher (SIWT) |  |
|--|---|------------------------------------|---|-------------------------|--|---|--|
|  |   | Lectures (L)                       | Practical classes (PC)                          | Laboratory classes (LC) |  |   |  |
| 103831 Problems of development of water legislation  | 4   | 3                                  | 3   | -                       | 6  | 6   |  |
| ACADEMIC INFORMATION ABOUT THE DISCIPLINE  |   |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| Learning Format  | Cycle, component  | Type of lectures                   | Type of practical classes                       |                         | Form and platform of final exam  |   |  |
| Offline  | Basic elective component  | classic review, analytical lecture | Problem solving, situational tasks, TOR, OUT OF |                         | oral exam  |   |  |
| Lecturer - (s)   | Jetibayev Nurbol S  |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| e-mail:  | <a href="mailto:Zhetybaev_14@mail.ru">Zhetybaev_14@mail.ru</a>  |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| Telephone:   | 8 7074607905  |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| Assistant- (s)   |   |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| e-mail:  | <a href="mailto:Zhetybaev_14@mail.ru">Zhetybaev_14@mail.ru</a>  |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| Telephone:   | 87074607905   |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| ACADEMIC PRESENTATION OF THE DISCIPLINE  |   |                                    |   |                         |  |   |  |
| Purpose of the discipline  | Expected Learning Outcomes (LO)*  |                                    |   |                         | Indicators of achievement LO (IA)  |   |  |
| The purpose of the discipline is to form a holistic view of the water legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the practice of applying the norms of water law, the specifics of relations in the field of use and protection of water bodies. | 1. To demonstrate an understanding of the content of the concept Issues in the Development of Water Legislation"  |                                    |   |                         | 1.1. To argue the specifics of the legal regulation of marine and energy relations in the field of ensuring environmental safety at the international and national levels.<br>1.2 Determine the place and role of norms in the field of legal provision of environmental safety in marine and energy relations in the legal system.<br>1.3 To argue the specifics of the legal consolidation of all the institutions of ensuring environmental safety. . |   |  |
|  | 2. To differentiate the methods of analysis of the legal provision of environmental safety on the basis of a critical assessment of their effectiveness for the proposal of a set of measures in the field of marine and energy relations |                                    |   |                         | 2.1.Apply methods of analyzing the conditions for the application of environmental safety standards in marine and energy relations.<br>2.2 Interpret the conditions for the application of certain norms regulating maritime and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety.<br>2.3 Analyze the specifics of the legislative consolidation of norms in the field of environmental safety in various practical situations.                  |   |  |

|                           |  |  |
|---------------------------|--|--|
|                           | <p>3. To analyze and identify the specifics of state regulation of marine and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety.</p>  | <p>3.1. Classify the methods of state regulation of marine and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety.</p> <p>3.2 Compare the methods of state regulation of marine and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety.</p> <p>3.3 Identify the similarities and differences of state regulation and management of marine and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety and the basis for the application of these methods</p>                                |
|                           | <p>4 Make recommendations on ensuring the effective application of legislation in the field of environmental safety in the field of marine and energy relations</p>  | <p>4.1. Develop measures to ensure legislation in the field of environmental safety in marine and energy relations.</p> <p>4.2 Explain the reasons for the violation of legislation in the field of environmental safety in marine and energy relations and their elimination.</p> <p>4.3 Develop plans to improve the enforcement of legislation in the field of ensuring environmental safety in marine and energy relations.</p>  |
|                           | <p>5. To evaluate the practice of legal regulation in the field of marine and energy relations in order to ensure environmental safety based on the analysis of international and national legislation and the development of specific proposals for improving the practice of its application.</p>  | <p>5.1 To substantiate the need for the application of legal mechanisms for regulating marine and energy relations in the field of ensuring environmental safety.</p> <p>5.2 Evaluate the experience of foreign countries in regulating marine and energy relations in the field of ensuring environmental safety.</p> <p>5.3 Assess the possibility of applying the positive experience of foreign countries in the regulation of marine and energy relations in the field of environmental safety.</p> |
| <b>Prerequisites</b>      | EPRK 2222 Environmental GPRK2204 R law of RK Civil law of RK (General part), GPRK3206 Civil law of Kazakhstan (Special part)   |  |
| <b>Postrequisites</b>     | PEB3408 Environmental Safety Law   |  |
| <b>Learning Resources</b> | <p><b>Literature:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Water Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 9, 2003, No. 481 (as amended and supplemented as of December 28, 2018).</li> <li>2. On Amendments and Additions to Certain Legislative Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan Regarding Subsoil Use. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 27, 2017, No. 126-VI.</li> </ol> |  |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Amendments and Additions to Certain Legislative Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan Regarding the Reduction of Permitting Documents and Simplification of Permitting Procedures” (as amended and supplemented as of January 1, 2019).</li> <li>4. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Amendments and Additions to Certain Legislative Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan Regarding the Delimitation of Powers between State Authorities” (as amended and supplemented as of January 1, 2019).</li> <li>5. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 4, 2018, No. 151-VI “On Amendments and Additions to Certain Legislative Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan Regarding the Regulation of Land Relations.”</li> <li>6. On Amending the Order of the Minister of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 8, 2015, No. 6-4/1072 “On Approving the Standard of State Service ‘Subsidization of the Cost of Water Supply Services to Agricultural Producers.’”</li> <li>7. Order of the Minister of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 2, 2015, No. 19-2/1054 “On Approving the Rules Defining Criteria for Classifying Dams as Declarable and the Rules for Developing a Dam Safety Declaration.”</li> <li>8. Order of the Minister of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 8, 2015, No. 6-4/1072 “On Approving the Standard of State Service ‘Subsidization of the Cost of Water Supply Services to Agricultural Producers.’”</li> <li>9. Joint Order of the Minister of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 25, 2015, No. 19-2/1131 and the Minister of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 28, 2015, No. 809 “On Approving the Criteria for Risk Assessment and the Checklist in the Field of Water Fund Use and Protection, and Dam Safety.”</li> </ol> <p>Order of the Acting Minister of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 18, 2016, No. 127 “On Approving the Standard of State Service ‘Sealing of Water Metering Devices Installed on Structures or Devices for Water Intake or Discharge by Physical and Legal Entities Engaged in Special Water Use.’”</p> <p><b>Internet resources:</b><br/>Internet resources (at least 3-5)<br/>1. <a href="http://elibrary.kaznu.kz/ru">http://elibrary.kaznu.kz/ru</a></p> |
|--|---|

|                                   |  |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| <b>Academic discipline policy</b> | <p>The academic policy of the discipline is determined by the Academic Policy and the Policy of Academic Integrity of KazNU Al-Farabi.</p> <p>Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer.</p> <p><b>Integration of science and education.</b> The research work of students, undergraduates, doctoral students is a deepening of the educational process. It is organized directly at the departments, laboratories, scientific and design departments of the university, in student scientific and technical associations. Independent work of students at all levels of education is aimed at developing research skills and competencies based on obtaining new knowledge using modern research and information technologies. A research university teacher integrates the results of scientific activities into the topics of lectures and seminars (practical) classes, laboratory classes and into tasks of the SIWT, SIW, which are reflected in the syllabus and are responsible for the relevance of the topics of training sessions and tasks.</p> <p><b>Attendance.</b> The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the content of the discipline. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points.</p> <p><b>Academic honesty.</b> Practical/laboratory classes, SIW develop the student's independence, critical thinking, and creativity. Plagiarism, forgery, the use of cheat sheets, cheating at all stages of completing assignments are unacceptable. Compliance with academic honesty during the period of theoretical training and at exams, in addition to the main policies, is regulated by the "Rules for the final control", "Instructions for the final control of the autumn / spring semester of the current academic year", "Regulations on checking text documents of students for the presence of borrowings."</p> <p>Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer.</p> <p><b>Basic principles of inclusive education.</b><br/>The educational environment of the university is conceived as a safe place where there is always support and equal attitude from the side of the teacher to all students and students to each other, regardless of gender, race / ethnicity, religious beliefs, socio-economic status, physical health of the student, etc. All people need the support and friendship of peers and fellow students. For all</p> |
|-----------------------------------|--|

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>students, progress is more about what they can do than what they can't. Diversity enhances all aspects of life.</p> <p>All students, especially those with disabilities, can receive advisory assistance by phone 8 777 206 0001</p> <p>toktybekov.prok@mail.ru</p> <p><a href="https://us04web.zoom.us/j/4175819644?pwd=UWFtS0hicFVick5vaE5WSy83WUVxZz09">https://us04web.zoom.us/j/4175819644?pwd=UWFtS0hicFVick5vaE5WSy83WUVxZz09</a></p> <p><a href="https://teams.live.com/l/invite/FEAOhRY5m0bHxAnbQE">https://teams.live.com/l/invite/FEAOhRY5m0bHxAnbQE</a></p> <p><b>MOOC integration (massive open online course).</b> If MOOC is integrated into the discipline, all students must register for MOOC. The deadlines for passing MOOC modules must be strictly observed in accordance with the schedule for studying the discipline.</p> <p><b>ATTENTION!</b> The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the content of the discipline, as well as in the MOOC. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points.</p> |
|--|---|

#### INFORMATION ABOUT TEACHING, LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT

| Score-rating letter system of assessment of accounting for educational achievements |                           |                   |  | Assessment Methods   |  |
|---|---------------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|
| Grade   | Digital equivalent points | points, % content | Assessment according to the traditional system | <p><b>Criteria-based assessment</b> is the process of correlating actual learning outcomes with expected learning outcomes based on clearly defined criteria. Based on formative and summative assessment.</p> <p><b>Formative assessment</b> is a type of assessment that is carried out in the course of daily learning activities. It is the current measure of progress. Provides an operational relationship between the student and the teacher. It allows you to determine the capabilities of the student, identify difficulties, help achieve the best results, timely correct the educational process for the teacher. The performance of tasks, the activity of work in the classroom during lectures, seminars, practical exercises (discussions, quizzes, debates, round tables, laboratory work, etc.) are evaluated. Acquired knowledge and competencies are assessed.</p> <p><b>Summative assessment</b> is a type of assessment that is carried out upon completion of the study of the section in accordance with the program of the discipline. Conducted 3-4 times per semester when performing SIW. This is the assessment of mastering the expected learning outcomes in relation to the descriptors. Allows you to determine and fix the level of mastering the discipline for a certain period. Learning outcomes are evaluated.</p> |  |
| A   | 4,0                       | 95-100            | Excellent                                      |  |  |
| A-  | 3,67                      | 90-94             |  |  |  |
| B+  | 3,33                      | 85-89             | Good   |  |  |
| B   | 3,0                       | 80-84             |  |  |  |
| B-  | 2,67                      | 75-79             |  |  |  |
| C+  | 2,33                      | 70-74             |  |  |  |
| C   | 2,0                       | 65-69             |  |  |  |
| C-  | 1,67                      | 60-64             |  |  |  |
| D+  |                           | 55-59             |  |  |  |
| D   |                           | 50-54             | Satisfactory                                   |  |  |
| FX  | 0,5                       | 25-49             |  |  |  |
| F   | 0                         | 0-24              |  |  |  |
|   |                           |                   |  | Unsatisfactory   |  |
|   |                           |                   |  |  |  |
| Formative and summative assessment  |                           | Points % content  |  |  |  |
| Activity at lectures  |                           |                   |  |  |  |
| Work in practical classes   |                           | 30                |  |  |  |
| Independent work  |                           | 30                |  |  |  |
| Design and creative activity  |                           | 0                 |  |  |  |
| Final exam  |                           | 40                |  |  |  |
| TOTAL   |                           | 100               |  |  |  |

#### Calendar (schedule) of the implementation of the content of the discipline. Methods of teaching and learning.

| Week  | Name of Topic  | Num. of hours | Max. score |
|---|--|---------------|------------|
| <b>MODULE 1 Introduction and Legal Foundations of Water Legislation</b> |  |               |            |
| 1   | <b>L 1.</b> Introduction to Water Legislation: Concepts and Importance | 1             |            |
|   | <b>LC 1.</b> Overview of water legislation in Kazakhstan               | 2             | 6          |

|   |  |   |            |
|---|--|---|------------|
| 2   | L 2. Sources of Water Law: National and International Norms  | 1 |            |
|   | LC 2. Discussion on international water treaties affecting Kazakhstan                                    | 2 | 6          |
| 3   | L 3. Legal Regulation of Water Resources Management  | 1 |            |
|   | LC 3. Analysis of water resource management policies in Kazakhstan                                       | 2 | 6          |
|   | SIWT 1. SIW 2 implementation advice.   |   |            |
| 4   | L 4. Rights and Obligations of Water Users   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 4. Legal responsibilities of industrial and agricultural water users                                  | 2 | 6          |
|   | SIW 1. Prepare a report on water user rights and dispute resolution mechanisms                           |   | 25         |
| 5   | L 5. Water Quality Standards and Control   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 5. Overview of water quality monitoring and enforcement   | 2 | 6          |
| <b>MODULE 2 Water Quality, Environmental Protection, and Control</b>      |  |   |            |
| 6   | L 6. Environmental Protection in Water Legislation   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 6. Discussion on legal measures for protecting water bodies   | 2 | 6          |
|   | SIWT 2. SIW 2 implementation advice.   |   |            |
| 7   | L 7. Legal Framework for Irrigation and Drainage Systems   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 7. Review of legislation regulating irrigation practices  | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIW 2 (form of debate). Topic: Study the role of law in managing irrigation infrastructure in Kazakhstan |   | 25         |
| 8   | L 8. Transboundary Water Resources and International Cooperation   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 8. Examination of cross-border water management issues  | 2 | 7          |
| <b>Midterm 1</b>  |  |   | <b>100</b> |
| 9   | L 9. Water Use Permits and Licensing   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 9. Procedures and legal requirements for water use permits  | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIWT 3. Case analysis of water permit issuance and disputes  |   |            |
| <b>MODULE 3 Water Use Regulation and Legal Liability</b>                  |  |   |            |
| 10  | L 10. Legal Liability for Water Law Violations   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 10. Sanctions and penalties under water legislation   | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIWT 4. SIW 3 implementation advice.   |   |            |
| 11  | L 11. Financing and Economic Mechanisms in Water Management  | 1 |            |
|   | LC 11. Economic incentives and tariffs for water use   | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIW 3. Topic: Study water pricing policies and their legal basis in Kazakhstan                           |   | 25         |
| <b>MODULE 4 Public Participation, Integration, and Future Development</b> |  |   |            |
| 12  | L 12. Water Legislation Reform: Challenges and Prospects   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 12. Current problems in water legislation development   | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIWT 5. SIW 4 implementation advice.   |   |            |
| 13  | L 13. Public Participation and Access to Information in Water Management                                 | 1 |            |
|   | LC 13. Role of public and NGOs in water legislation implementation                                       | 2 | 7          |
|   | SIW 4. implementation advice.  |   |            |
| 14  | L 14. The issues of financial and economic law as an institution of financial law.                       | 1 |            |
|   | LC 14. Legal coordination between water, environmental, and land legislation                             |   | 7          |
|   | LC 14. Legal coordination between water, environmental, and land legislation                             | 2 | 25         |
| 15  | L 15. Problems of Development of Water Legislation in Kazakhstan   | 1 |            |
|   | LC 15. Identifying key challenges and proposing solutions for water law development                      | 2 | 8          |
|   | SIWT 6. Advice for the Final Exam.   |   |            |
| <b>Midterm 2</b>  |  |   | <b>100</b> |
| <b>Final exam</b>   |  |   | <b>100</b> |
| <b>FINAL for discipline</b>   |  |   | <b>100</b> |

Dean

Head of department

Chairman of the Academic  
Committee on the quality  
of training and education

Lecturer



U.A. Akhatov

G.A. Kuanaliyeva

A.A. Urisbaeva

T.A. Toktybekov

**RUBRICATOR OF SUMMATIVE ASSESSMENT**  
**CRITERIA FOR ASSESSING LEARNING OUTCOMES**

**Student Independent Work**1. Topic: Prepare a report on water user rights and dispute resolution mechanisms

| Criteria  | Excellent (20-25%)   | Good (15-20%)   | Satisfactory (10-15%)  | Unsatisfactory (0-10%)   |
|---|--|---|--|--|
| <b>Understanding of Water User Rights</b>             | Deep and comprehensive understanding of the types, legal basis, and responsibilities of water user rights. Uses relevant and authoritative references. | Good understanding of water user rights with relevant references.         | Limited understanding of water user rights; some key aspects missing or unclear.         | Superficial or incorrect understanding; lacks relevant references.         |
| <b>Explanation of Dispute Resolution Mechanisms</b>   | Detailed explanation of formal and alternative dispute resolution methods with examples. Clear link to water user rights.                              | Clear explanation of dispute resolution methods with some examples.       | Basic description of dispute resolution methods; lacks examples or detailed explanation. | Poor or incomplete explanation; missing key mechanisms or examples.        |
| <b>Use of Empirical Evidence and Legal References</b> | Strong use of empirical studies, case law, and primary legal sources to support arguments.   | Adequate use of empirical and legal sources; some evidence-based support. | Limited use of sources; mostly general statements without solid evidence.                | No or very weak use of empirical or legal sources; unsupported statements. |
| <b>Practical Recommendations and Analysis</b>         | Provides well-justified and practical recommendations to improve water user rights enforcement and dispute resolution.                                 | Offers reasonable recommendations with some analysis.                     | Recommendations are vague or not well supported by analysis.                             | Few or no recommendations; analysis missing or very weak.                  |
| <b>Writing Quality and APA Style</b>                  | Writing is clear, coherent, and error-free. Strict adherence to APA style formatting and citations.  | Writing is mostly clear with minor errors. Basically follows APA style.   | Some errors in clarity and APA style.  | Writing is unclear or confusing; many APA formatting and citation errors.  |

**Student Independent Work 2** Topic: Study the role of law in managing irrigation infrastructure in Kazakhstan

| Criteria   | Excellent (20-25%)   | Good (15-20%)   | Satisfactory (10-15%)   | Unsatisfactory (0-10%)  |
|--|--|---|---|---|
| <b>Understanding of Legal Framework</b>            | Deep and comprehensive understanding of laws regulating irrigation infrastructure in Kazakhstan. Clear explanation of relevant legislation and policies.     | Good understanding of legal framework with relevant legislation cited.  | Basic understanding of laws; some key regulations or policies are missing or unclear. | Superficial or incorrect understanding of legal framework; lacks citations of laws or policies. |
| <b>Analysis of Management Role</b>                 | Thorough analysis of how law supports management, maintenance, and development of irrigation infrastructure. Uses examples and case studies from Kazakhstan. | Clear analysis of law's role with some examples.                        | General description of legal role; lacks depth and practical examples.                | Incomplete or inaccurate analysis; missing practical context or examples.                       |
| <b>Use of Empirical Evidence and Legal Sources</b> | Strong use of primary legal sources, government documents, and empirical studies to support arguments.   | Adequate use of legal documents and empirical evidence.                 | Limited use of sources; mostly general statements without solid support.              | No or very weak use of empirical or legal sources; unsupported statements.                      |
| <b>Practical Recommendations</b>                   | Provides well-grounded recommendations for improving legal management of irrigation infrastructure.  | Offers reasonable recommendations with some justification.              | Recommendations are vague or only loosely related to legal aspects.                   | Few or no recommendations; lacking analysis or relevance to legal management.                   |
| <b>Writing Quality and APA Style</b>               | Writing is clear, concise, and free of errors. Strict adherence to APA citation and formatting rules.  | Writing is mostly clear with minor errors; basically follows APA style. | Some errors in clarity and APA formatting.  | Writing is unclear or confusing; many APA formatting and citation errors.                       |

**Student Independent Work 3.** Topic: Study water pricing policies and their legal basis in Kazakhstan

| Criteria  | Excellent (20-25%)   | Good (15-20%)  | Satisfactory (10-15%)   | Unsatisfactory (0-10%)   |
|---|--|--|---|--|
| <b>Understanding of Water Pricing Policies</b>    | Thorough and insightful understanding of water pricing policies in Kazakhstan, including objectives, methods, and impact analysis. | Clear understanding of pricing policies with relevant examples and explanations. | Basic understanding of pricing policies; some key points or impacts are missing or unclear. | Superficial or incorrect understanding of water pricing policies; lacks important details or examples. |
| <b>Legal Basis and Regulatory Framework</b>       | Comprehensive analysis of laws and regulations governing water pricing with citations of relevant legal acts and policies.         | Good analysis of legal framework with references to key legislation.             | Limited explanation of legal basis; key laws or regulations are only partially covered.     | Weak or missing analysis of legal framework; lacks references to relevant legislation.                 |
| <b>Use of Empirical Evidence and Case Studies</b> | Strong use of empirical data, case studies, and official reports to support arguments and illustrate policy effects.               | Adequate use of data and examples to back claims.                                | Limited use of empirical evidence or case studies; arguments are mostly theoretical.        | No or very weak use of empirical evidence or examples; unsupported claims.                             |
| <b>Practical Recommendations</b>                  | Provides clear, well-founded recommendations for improving water pricing policies and legal frameworks.                            | Offers reasonable recommendations with some supporting arguments.                | Recommendations are vague or insufficiently supported by analysis.                          | Few or no recommendations; lacking relevance or justification.   |
| <b>Writing Quality and APA Style</b>              | Writing is clear, concise, and free of errors. Strict adherence to APA citation and formatting rules.                              | Writing is mostly clear with minor errors; basically follows APA style.          | Some errors in clarity and APA formatting.  | Writing is unclear or confusing; many APA formatting and citation errors.                              |



**Student Independent Work 4**

Topic: Prepare an analytical paper on recent legislative reforms in water law (project preparation).

| Criteria   | Excellent (20-25%)  | Good (15-20%)  | Satisfactory (10-15%)  | Unsatisfactory (0-10%)   |
|--|---|--|--|--|
| <b>Understanding of Recent Legislative Reforms</b> | Deep, detailed understanding of recent water law reforms with clear explanation of key changes and their implications.  | Good understanding of legislative reforms with explanation of major changes. | Basic understanding of reforms; some important aspects missing or unclear.     | Superficial or incorrect understanding; key reforms not mentioned or misunderstood.                |
| <b>Analysis of Legal Impact and Effectiveness</b>  | Thorough analysis of the impact and effectiveness of reforms on water management and stakeholders with supporting data. | Clear analysis of impact and effectiveness with some evidence or examples.   | General description of impact; lacks detailed analysis or supporting evidence. | Weak or no analysis of impact; unsupported claims or missing evaluation.                           |
| <b>Use of Empirical Evidence and Legal Sources</b> | Strong use of up-to-date legal texts, government documents, case studies, and empirical research to support arguments.  | Adequate use of legal documents and empirical evidence to back claims.       | Limited use of sources; arguments mostly theoretical without solid backing.    | No or very weak use of empirical or legal sources; unsupported statements.                         |
| <b>Recommendations and Future Perspectives</b>     | Provides insightful, realistic recommendations for further reforms and improvements based on analysis.                  | Offers reasonable recommendations with some justification.                   | Recommendations are vague, general, or only partially related to reforms.      | Few or no recommendations; lacking relevance or justification.                                     |
| <b>Writing Quality and APA Style</b>               | Writing is clear, well-structured, error-free; strictly follows APA citation and formatting guidelines.                 | Writing is mostly clear with minor errors; generally follows APA style.      | Some errors in clarity, structure, or APA formatting.                          | Writing is unclear, poorly structured, many errors; frequent APA formatting and citation mistakes. |